

Minutes

of a meeting of the

Planning Committee

held on Thursday, 29 May 2014 at 6.30 pm
in the The Lockinge Room, The Beacon,
Portway, Wantage, OX12 9BY



Open to the public, including the press

Present:

Members: Councillors Robert Sharp (Chairman), Sandy Lovatt (Vice-Chairman), Eric Batts, Roger Cox, Anthony Hayward, Bob Johnston, Bill Jones, Jerry Patterson, Janet Shelley, Margaret Turner, Catherine Webber, Richard Webber and John Woodford

Officers: Martin Deans, Mark Doodes, Sarah Green, Jennifer Thompson

Other members present: Councillor Yvonne Constance

Number of members of the public: 120

PI.16 CHAIRMAN'S ANNOUNCEMENTS

The chairman welcomed everyone to the meeting.

PI.17 URGENT BUSINESS

None.

PI.18 NOTIFICATION OF SUBSTITUTES AND APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

Councillor Sue Marchant sent her apologies.

PI.19 MINUTES

No minutes were available for approval.

PI.20 DECLARATIONS OF PECUNIARY INTERESTS AND OTHER DECLARATIONS

None.

PI.21 STATEMENTS AND PETITIONS FROM THE PUBLIC ON PLANNING APPLICATIONS

A list showing the members of the public wishing to address the committee on each planning application was tabled and agenda items were taken in the order of the list.

PI.22 STATEMENTS, PETITIONS AND QUESTIONS FROM THE PUBLIC ON OTHER MATTERS

None.

PI.23 P14/V0080/FUL LAND AT PENSTONES FARM, HORSECROFT, STANFORD IN THE VALE

The officer presented the report on application P14/V0080/FUL for planning permission for the construction of 18 homes, of which seven are affordable units, three are full open market and eight are over-55's units on land at Penstones Farm, Horsecroft, Stanford in the Vale.

Consultations, representations, policy and guidance and this site's planning history are detailed in the officer's report which forms part of the agenda pack for this meeting.

Updates from the report:

Oxfordshire County Council reported that they maintained their objection to the application because of the pressure on places at the school.

Mark Isaacs, representing Stanford in the Vale Parish Council, spoke objecting to the application. His concerns included the following:

- the primary school was at capacity. Recently granted planning permission for 73 houses would put pressure on school places;
- the village had started to prepare a neighbourhood plan. Initial responses did not favour development on this site, and wished to safeguard conservation areas from development;
- the site design was not integrated or inclusive.

Nina Stillion, a local resident, spoke objecting to the application. Her concerns included the following:

- the relationship of the development to the village;
- the impact of increased traffic, lack of pavement over the whole length of the access to the site, and the unsafe junction;
- unacceptable design lacking in provision of open space and infrastructure.

Simon Tofts, the applicant's agent, spoke in favour of the application. His speech included the following:

- The application as set out dealt with the concerns and there were no objections from statutory or professional bodies;
- The application provided ample parking on site, open space, and a package of off-site improvements. This included provision for education which could be used to extend the school, and a contribution to the parish council.

Councillor Robert Sharp, one of the ward councillors, said he had reservations about the application, including concerns about the access road and the impact on this part of the village. Eighteen houses did not make a significant difference to the housing land supply.

The committee considered this application, with advice from officers where appropriate; the discussion covered the following points:

- This was not a strategic site.
- The impact of the development on the setting of the adjacent listed building on the edge of the settlement, which after debate was considered to be detrimental.
- The impact of the development on the rural setting of this part of the village, and the impact of extending the built up area of the village onto this site, which after debate was considered to be detrimental on balance.
- On balance, given the consultation responses from statutory and professional bodies, the proposal was acceptable. However, the development placed too much pressure on the school and the developer contribution could not mitigate this. The cumulative impact of recent permissions and this application on the local primary school was unacceptable. The committee took seriously Oxfordshire County Council's continued objection because the school would not be able to accommodate the extra children.
- The site layout did not encourage cohesion and a mixed community.
- While the emerging neighbourhood plan was not a material consideration, some weight should be attached to the results of the initial consultations, and in particular the lack of local support for development on this site.
- Notwithstanding the comments from the highways authority, the committee considered the access to the site for the additional vehicles and pedestrians along and into Horsecroft was not safe or of acceptable standard along the full length.

On being put to the vote, the motion to approve the application in line with the officer's recommendation was lost by eight votes to five.

After further debate (included above) the committee voted to refuse the application for the reasons set out below, with Councillors Patterson and Woodford voting against.

RESOLVED (for 8; against 4; abstentions 1)

to refuse planning permission for P14/V0080/FUL, land at Penstones Farm, Horsecroft, Stanford in the Vale, for the following reasons:

1. Development of this site would have an adverse visual impact on the views across this site for adjacent residents and walkers, and would have an adverse impact on the open rural character of this part of the village, contrary to policy NE9 of the Vale of White Horse District Council Local Plan 2011.
2. Development of this site would have an adverse impact on the rural and open setting of the adjacent listed and historic buildings, and this was not sufficiently mitigated by the site layout, contrary to policy HE1 of the Vale of White Horse District Council Local Plan 2011.
3. The application was considered to be premature given the development of the neighbourhood plan.

PI.24 P13/V2731/O WILLOW FARM, PACKHORSE LANE, MARCHAM

The officer presented the report on application P13/V2731/O for outline permission for the erection of 54 dwelling houses with all matters reserved except access at Willow Farm, Packhorse Lane, Marcham, OX13 6NU.

Consultations, representations, policy and guidance and this site's planning history are detailed in the officer's report which forms part of the agenda pack for this meeting. There were no updates to the report.

David Walton, representing Marcham Parish Council, spoke about the application. He said that:

- the parish council had not voted to reject this application but would prefer a lower housing density and were concerned that the projected number of children was too low;
- the S106 agreement should require a new primary school classroom;
- a road through this development linking to adjacent sites, two-lane with pavement, should be provided;
- local design guidelines should be taken into account.

Bob Anderson, a local resident, spoke objecting to the application. His concerns related to the proposed access onto the busy main road, and the effect on the bus stop and access to the houses opposite the site.

Debbie Jones, the applicant's agent, spoke in favour of the application. Her speech included the following:

- the layout was illustrative;
- the final design details were to be agreed and would respect the village's design guidelines;
- the applicant was aware of the need to discuss the location of the bus stop with the highways authority.

Councillor Catherine Webber, one of the ward councillors, spoke about the application. The points she raised included concerns about the higher than preferred density; education provision and links between separate but adjacent developments.

The committee considered this application, with advice from officers where appropriate; the discussion covered access, internal connections between developments, and education provision.

RESOLVED: (for 12; against 0; abstentions1)

to grant outline planning permission for application P13/V2731/O, Willow Farm Packhorse Lane Marcham, OX13 6NU, subject to:

completion of section 106 agreements to secure:

- on-site affordable housing provision
- on-site open space provision
- contributions towards off-site facilities and services

and the following conditions:

1. Requirement for receipt of a reserved matters application or a detailed scheme within six months and the scheme to be available for implementation within 18 months from the date of the outline permission to help address the immediate housing land shortfall.
2. Approved plans.
3. Details of access onto Packhorse lane.
4. MC2 - materials (samples).
5. HY6 - access, parking and turning in accordance with plan.
6. HY12 - new estate roads.
7. LS1 - landscaping scheme.
8. Open space management plan.
9. LS4 - tree protection.
10. Drainage details (surface and foul).
11. Sustainable drainage scheme.
12. Drainage strategy in accordance with flood risk assessment.
13. Grampian condition on water capacity.
14. RE7[I] – boundary details in accordance with plan.
15. RE5 - restriction on fences / walls.
16. RE11 - garage accommodation.
17. Refuse bin storage.
18. Cycleway / footpath route network.
19. Construction traffic management plan.
20. Residential travel plan.

and that the issuing of planning permission on completion of the S106 agreement be delegated to head of planning in consultation with the committee chairman.

PI.25 P14/V0625/FUL LAND ACCESSED TO THE SOUTH AND REAR OF 89A-93 EYNHAM ROAD, BOTLEY

The officer presented the report on application P14/V0625/FUL for planning permission to build 6 dwelling units comprising 2 one-bedroom flats, 2 two-bedroom flats and 2 studio flats within a single building on land at the south and rear of 89A - 93 Eynsham Road, Botley Oxford, OX2 9DG.

Consultations, representations, policy and guidance and this site's planning history are detailed in the officer's report which forms part of the agenda pack for this meeting.

Updates from the report

- Thames Water had raised no objections on grounds of water or sewerage capacity.
- There were no objections raised by the police or the council's drainage engineer.
- The recommendations in the report were amended to delete 'outline' and the text in the paragraph after 'the following conditions'.

Harry Dickinson, representing Cumnor Parish Council, spoke in support of the application.

Deborah Waller, a local resident, spoke objecting to the application. Her concerns included access and traffic, drainage, and the harm to the immediate locality.

Fran Ryan and Chris Askew, the applicant and agent, spoke in support of the application.

Councillor Judy Roberts, one of the ward councillors, spoke in support of the application.

Councillor John Woodford, one of the ward councillors, spoke about the application.

The committee considered this application, with advice from officers where appropriate.

RESOLVED: (for 13; against 0)

to grant planning permission for application P14/V0625/FUL, land at the south and rear of 89A - 93 Eynsham Road, Botley Oxford, OX2 9DG, subject to:

completion of section 106 agreement to secure:

- car club provision arrangements on site
- clarification of off-site facilities and services (waste collection)
- off site highway works to junction (to close off eastern arm)

and the following conditions:

1. Three year time limit (full permission).
2. Approved drawings.
3. Materials.
4. Shared TV aeriels.
5. Slab level.
6. Boundary details.
7. Landscape scheme – submission and subsequent implementation.
8. Tree protection.
9. Access (including closure of east access lane), parking and turning, cycle storage.
10. Sustainable travel information pack shall be provided.
11. Drainage details (surface and foul).
12. Sustainable urban drainage scheme.
13. Refuse storage facilities.

and to note that the head of planning will issue permission in consultation with the committee chairman.

PI.26 P13/V2708/FUL KINGS FARM COTTAGE, EBBS LANE, EAST HANNEY

The officer presented the report on application P13/V2708/FUL for planning permission for demolition of the existing outbuildings on the site and the erection of three detached dwellings at Kings Farm Cottage, Ebbs Lane, East Hanney, OX12 0HL.

Consultations, representations, policy and guidance and this site's planning history are detailed in the officer's report which forms part of the agenda pack for this meeting.

Judy Long, representing East Hanney Parish Council, spoke objecting to the application. Her concerns included the risk of flooding and contamination, damage from construction vehicles, and overdevelopment of the site.

Jonathan Ede the applicant's agent, spoke in favour of the application. His speech included an explanation of the flood mitigation measures.

The committee considered this application, with advice from officers where appropriate.

RESOLVED (for 11; against 2)

to grant planning permission for application P13/V2708/FUL, Kings Farm Cottage, Ebbs Lane, East Hanney, OX12 0HL, subject to the following conditions:

1. Commencement three years - full planning permission.
2. Approved plans.
3. Samples of materials.
4. Visibility splays to be submitted and approved.
5. Landscaping scheme, including hard and soft landscaping, boundary treatments to be submitted for approval.
6. Implementation of approved landscaping scheme.
7. Detailed sustainable drainage scheme to be submitted, approved and implemented.
8. Parking provided as shown on plan.
9. Works to be carried out in accordance with tree survey, arboricultural report and accompanying tree protection plan.
10. Development to be in accordance with the flood risk assessment and mitigation measures.

PI.27 P14/V0382/FUL LAND ADJACENT TO HUMBER BARN, WESTCOT, WANTAGE

The officer presented the report on application P14/V0382/FUL for planning permission to part single storey and part two storey detached house on land adjacent to Humber Barn, Westcot, Wantage.

Consultations, representations, policy and guidance and this site's planning history are detailed in the officer's report which forms part of the agenda pack for this meeting.

Iain Brown, representing Sparsholt Parish Council, spoke in support of the application. His points included the following:

- The community required modest and controlled growth and this continued a long tradition of such growth.
- This met policy H13 which allows for one or two houses as infill within the built up area of a community.
- There was strong local support.

Tim Comyn, a local resident, spoke objecting to the application and in support of the officer's recommendation. His concerns included the following:

- This was a small settlement with no facilities, and limited facilities in Sparsholt. Therefore the site is in an unsustainable location with a heavy reliance on a car.
- There were no special circumstances to justify the development.

John O'Gorman, the applicant, spoke in favour of the application. Her/his speech included the following:

- The site was well screened and there were no open views across or onto the site.
- The settlement benefited from a bus service and was within walking distance of Sparsholt.
- A smaller house would complement the existing larger extended houses.

Councillor Yvonne Constance, one of the ward councillors, spoke in support of the application. The points she raised included the following:

Vale Of White Horse District Council – Planning Committee Minutes

- The proposed development had no adverse impact in planning terms and caused no harm, being well screened and causing no objections on highways grounds.
- This should be considered an infill site and contributes to the settlement.

The committee considered this application, with advice from officers where appropriate.

RESOLVED: (for 7; against 6)

to refuse planning permission for application P14/V0382/FUL, land adjacent to Humber Barn Westcot Wantage, for the following reasons:

- 1 : Unsustainable location contrary to policy GS1.
- 2 : No agricultural justification, unsustainable location – policy H12 and National Planning Policy Framework.
- 3 : Not infilling, pressure on neighbouring plots.
- 4 : Impact on open outlook of the lowland vale in this immediate area (policy NE9).

PI.28 P14/V0296/FUL LAND ADJACENT TO 3 MARCHAM ROAD, DRAYTON

The officer presented the report on application P14/V0296/FUL for two one-bedroom flats and one three- bedroom house, all for social housing use, on land adjacent to 3 Marcham Road, Drayton, Abingdon, OX14 4JH.

Consultations, representations, policy and guidance and this site's planning history are detailed in the officer's report which forms part of the agenda pack for this meeting.

Updates to the report

- One further objection from a local resident.

Councillor Richard Webber, one of the ward councillors, spoke in support of the application.

The committee considered this application, with advice from officers where appropriate.

RESOLVED: (for 13; against 0)

to grant planning permission for application P14/V0296/FUL on land adjacent to 3 Marcham Road, Drayton, Abingdon, OX14 4JH subject to the completion of a section 106 agreement to secure the affordable housing, and the following conditions:

1. Commencement three years - full planning permission.
2. List of approved plans.
3. Access, parking and turning in accordance with plan.
4. Samples of materials to be approved.
5. Drainage details(surface and foul) to be submitted.
6. Boundary details to be submitted.
7. Window cill height for eastern first floor window to be no lower than 1.7m.
8. Obscure glazing for western first floor window.
9. No additional windows to be inserted at first floor in east and west elevations.

PI.29 P13/V2728/FUL MANOR FARM, BOURTON

The officer presented the report on application P13/V2728/FUL for planning permission for the removal of all modern agricultural buildings, except one to the very rear of the site; conversion of the traditional barn into two four-bedroom dwellings; construction of two three-bedroom semi-detached dwellings at Manor Farm, Bourton, SN6 8HU.

Consultations, representations, policy and guidance and this site's planning history are detailed in the officer's report which forms part of the agenda pack for this meeting.

Gail Macdonald, the applicant's agent, spoke in support of the application.

The committee considered this application, with advice from officers where appropriate.

RESOLVED: (for 13; against 0)

to grant planning permission for application P13/V2728/FUL at Manor Farm, Bourton, SN6 8HU subject to the following conditions:

1. Commencement of development – three years.
2. List of approved plans.
3. Materials for stone walls of barn to match existing.
4. Samples of materials for barn roof and new houses to be submitted for approval.
5. Details of artificial swallow nesting boxes to be submitted.
6. Works to be carried out in accordance with great crested newt working statement.
7. Access and parking to be in accordance with plan.
8. Car ports to be retained for parking.
9. Details of landscaping scheme to be submitted.
10. Landscaping scheme to be implemented.
11. Details of Sustainable drainage scheme to be submitted.
12. Contaminated land condition.

PI.30 P14/V0338/FUL LAND ADJACENT TO ELM TREE WALK, SHIPPON

The officer presented the report on application P14/V0338/FUL for two detached dwellings and two detached garages on land adjacent to Elm Tree Walk, Shippon.

Consultations, representations, policy and guidance and this site's planning history are detailed in the officer's report which forms part of the agenda pack for this meeting.

Geoff Fitzgerald, representing St Helen Without Parish Council, spoke in support of the application.

Paul Butt, the applicant's agent, spoke in favour of the application.

Councillor Catherine Webber, one of the ward councillors, spoke in support of the application.

The committee considered this application, with advice from officers where appropriate.

RESOLVED: (for 9; against 1; abstentions 3)

to refuse planning permission for application P14/V0338/FUL, land adjacent to Elm Tree Walk, Shippon, for the following reason:

In the opinion of the Local Planning Authority the area of land could accommodate more than two dwellings and it is considered that the fact that only two dwellings are proposed does not of itself mean that the construction of two dwellings on the land amounts to limited infilling. As such the proposal is considered to be contrary to policy GS3 of the adopted Vale of White Horse Local Plan and the provisions of the National Planning Policy Framework.

PI.31 P14/V0487/FUL THE GOLDINGS, STONEHILL LANE, SOUTHMOOR

The officer presented the report on application P14/V0487/FUL for planning permission to demolish the existing three-bedroom detached house and build two semi-detached three-bedroom houses at The Goldings, Stonehill Lane, Southmoor, OX13 5HU.

Consultations, representations, policy and guidance and this site's planning history are detailed in the officer's report which forms part of the agenda pack for this meeting.

The committee considered this application, with advice from officers where appropriate.

RESOLVED: (for 13; against 0)

to grant planning permission for application P14/V0487/FUL, The Goldings, Stonehill Lane, Southmoor, OX13 5HU, subject to the following conditions:

1. Commencement three years - full planning permission.
2. List of approved plans.
3. Samples of materials to be approved.
4. Access and parking to be in accordance with plan.
5. Development to be carried out in accordance with submitted arboricultural method statement.
6. Development to be carried out in accordance with submitted foundation design unless alternative agreed with the local planning authority.
7. Sustainable drainage scheme to be approved and implemented.
8. Removal of permitted development rights for rear extensions.

PI.32 MATERIALS

No materials were considered.

The meeting closed at 10.15 pm